

Evaluating Librarians For Comparable Worth

By

Leah Saenz de Viteri

Introduction

The subject of this paper is the analysis of comparable worth as it applies to the position of librarian. The first part of the paper deals with the literature review, which provides a background of comparable worth, how studies are conducted using job evaluations, and the economic background and explanation of it. I then go into a detailed description of the job to be studied; librarian. I found comparable jobs that can be compared on an educational as well as functional level. I then determined an evaluation system to rate these jobs, formulated questions that assess the particular factors in the evaluation, and then evaluated each job depending on the degrees to which a certain factor is relevant to each job. After the evaluations were done, I came up with a final conclusion as to whether librarians (stereotypical female job) are underpaid compared to their male job counterparts.

The idea of comparable worth, wage differentials, and pay equity has been a big issue in terms of gender equality. For years men have been making more than women, regardless if they were performing similar jobs or not. Many reasons for this pay inequality have been established and tested. In my thesis I will explore these reasons and see which ones are the determining factors of why librarians, in particular, are not paid equitably for the jobs they do. There is much to be learned about gender differences in pay and one way to do that is to focus on a particular occupation that is known to be, for the most part, gender specific.

Comparable Worth

The comparable worth perspective rests on the theoretical premise that because women are socially devalued, so too is the work they do. Thus, the perception that women's work is less valuable than men's, serves in itself as justification of the lower pay they receive. According to the neoclassical view of wage differences, women earn less than men because they possess less

human capital and/or because they are less productive workers. (England) Neoclassical Theory of Human Capital states that pay differences between individuals are explained by human capital, the stock of skills a person possesses. The theory says that you would pay more for skilled workers if gaining these skills were an “investment”. (Stanek Kilbourne)

Job Evaluations

To determine productivity on the job, human capital skills, or what a specific job entails, job evaluations are done. England and Dunn (1988) use job evaluations to judge whether comparable men’s and women’s jobs are treated differently. What job evaluations can do is determine whether women’s jobs are paid less than comparable men’s jobs, given a certain set of weights. After weights are determined, a total-point score is calculated for each job, and the best fitting line is drawn. If one looks at a scattergram of pay against total job points for an entire organization, a nearly universal finding is that predominantly men’s jobs cluster above the line and women’s jobs below the line. This means that for any given number of points, men’s jobs pay more than women’s jobs. Job evaluation studies of national data consistently finds female jobs to be underpaid. An explanation for this is that skills that men stereotypically hold are more sought after and more valued than skills stereotypically possessed by women. For example, on the evaluations, physical strength and mathematical skills were more valued than finger dexterity and skills in human relations, which can be termed a nurturant skill. Nurturant skills are the sort of social skills involved in providing face-to-face service to clients or customers of an organization. (Stanek Kilbourne) The view that men possess more desired skills is given as one of the reasons for their higher wages.

Theories of Discrimination

Because men's skills are viewed as more desirable, this might lead to only seeking out and hiring men, otherwise known as discrimination. Discrimination is seen as a big part for the lower wages that women receive. There are many different views for the reasons of discrimination.

Theory of Split Labor Markets

One view is from Bonacich's theory of split labor markets. She argues that the dominant group of workers benefit from keeping minorities out of desirable jobs. Applying this to the particular case of gender discrimination, her idea suggests that men gain from segregating women into lower paying jobs and from assigning lower wages to women's occupations. By doing this, employers who devalue the work of women can pay more to men.

Marxist View

Marxists argue that sex discrimination is a way to increase profits by a strategy to "divide and conquer". In this view, employers benefit from hostility between segments of labor because this prevents unity and organization among workers, which would be a real threat to capitalist interests. This theory deflects the "us against them" worker versus management mentality and focuses on provoking dissension between coworkers.

Neoclassical View

The last view on discrimination is the neoclassical economic model. The neoclassical model rejects any idea of discrimination, claiming that the problem will correct itself in the long run because of market conditions. Their defense is that those employers with the least inclination to discriminate will hire women. These employers will find that women are a bargain because other employers' discriminatory acts have lowered the wage that women will accept.

Since the employers hiring women have relatively low labor costs, they will be advantaged in competitive product and capital markets, and will thereby gain increasing market share and thus employ more of the total labor force. As employers who will not hire women lose market share or go out of business, women's job distributions should converge with men's. And, since a few hiring discriminators are left, women should no longer need to offer to work at a discriminatory wage to be hired.

Even if there is a cartel in place to discriminate against women, there is always an incentive for one of the members to cheat and go outside the terms of the cartel and hire women at a lower wage, and become more profitable. So, according to the neoclassical model, discrimination is inefficient and will not hold up in firms who want to maintain or gain market share and be profitable.

Many economists see wage discrimination as impossible in the absence of barriers to entry. Employers would not be able to pay women less if it weren't for unequal access to available jobs or hiring discrimination. Thus, they focus on barriers to entry as the "real" problem, leading some to oppose comparable worth pay adjustments. (England)

Hiring Discrimination: Crowding Out

Not only does wage discrimination exist, but hiring discrimination also has an effect on women. One view that some economists accept on hiring discrimination is the idea of women "crowding" a certain market or occupation. Hiring discrimination is believed to limit the number of occupations women can enter and thus shift outward the supply curve to the occupations women are allowed to enter. In this view, the "crowding" of female occupations is the reason they pay less than male occupations that have the same job evaluation points.

Evaluating Librarians for Comparable Worth

Taking all this information and applying it to librarians, we can easily see that the occupation of a librarian is seen as a stereotypically female job. (Blau) The idea that librarians fit into the “female” job mold implies that they only need the skills stereotypically possessed by a woman. While this is true to a certain extent, librarians need a lot more than just those skills to be efficient in their jobs. In the article “Sources of Tension and Conflict Between Librarians and Faculty”, Biggs (1981) explains the complexity of being a librarian. A librarian must be “an industrial engineer, a comptroller, a business manager, a computer analyst, as well as a bookman, all (characteristics) are necessary.” The increasing technology in libraries makes the job of a librarian much more challenging and difficult. The increase in technology require an extensive on-the-job training program and much more time and effort than the previous systems and techniques utilized by libraries. Librarians need more continuing education to keep on top of their rapidly changing field, and more graduate training in other subject areas to facilitate collection analysis, materials selection, and research assistance to patrons. With the evidence of all this training and education that librarians need, it is obvious that they should be making more than they in fact are.

Further analysis into the job descriptions of librarians found other tasks that librarians were responsible for. A description of the nature of their job is as follows:

- to organize and maintain programs for selection and purchase requires skilled business sense, efficiency, and an ability to determine which materials are necessary
- librarians must also know the community and people that their libraries serve
- review books, prepare bibliographies, give advice to students, schools or other organizations on sources of information, organize activities such as children’s story hour, literacy programs, or summer reading programs, or arrange an exhibit
- technical tasks include: ordering, cataloging, and classifying materials according to the Dewey Decimal, Library of Congress, or other system

purchasing, maintenance, and evaluation of circulation systems. Considerable technical knowledge of computer systems may be necessary (Hopke 1993:292)

The main focus of the study was to examine public librarians and their wages. At the head of the public library system is the library director, who sets library policies and plans and administers programs of library services, usually under the guidance of a governing body, such as a board of directors or board of trustees. Library directors have overall responsibility for the operation of a library system. Among their many duties, they coordinate the activities of the chief librarians, who supervise branch libraries or individual departments, such as the circulation, general reference, or music department; periodical reading room; or readers' advisory service. In a large public library a chief librarian supervises a staff of assistant librarians and division heads, and administers and coordinates the functions of the library.

Due to the nature of the work and the certain functions that the jobs evokes, there are certain education requirements.

- graduate from high school and college and take a fifth year of specialized study to earn a master's degree in library science (MLS)
 - be familiar with numerous subject areas
 - for work in research libraries, university libraries, or special collections, a doctorate may be required
 - take part in community affairs, cooperating in the preparation of exhibits, presenting book reviews, and explaining library use to community organizations
 - imaginative, resourceful, tactful, patient
- (Hopke 1993:294)

At first glance of all these requirements, educational and functional, it appears that librarians are underpaid. In order to see the extent of their unfair pay, you need to have some basis for comparison. The next step was to find jobs that were comparable, whether it be by function or just simply the amount of education needed to perform the job. When I first started

looking for jobs that were comparable I looked for jobs with similar functions and job descriptions. Archivists and museum curators were the most similar jobs according to function. Many of the job descriptions were the same. However, I felt that these occupations were not a good basis for comparison because they too were basically dominated by females and were also underpaid. This was not going to help me prove my case. There weren't any typical male jobs that were comparable according to job function alone. I then turned to jobs that had some similar job functions and also ones that weren't necessarily that similar in function, but had mostly similar educational requirements. The jobs that were comparable were civil engineers, municipal administrators, and school administrators/principals.

The civil engineer has the same educational requirements as the librarian, 4 years of college and 1 year beyond that for specialized training. The functions however are not very similar. The major difference between civil engineers and librarians is that civil engineers are held responsible for the advice and suggestions they give, while librarians are not. Librarians are simply there to give direction on where to get information, but they cannot be held accountable if they give you wrong information or are not able to give you all that you are looking for. Civil engineers on the other hand are responsible for all the information they give and can be held accountable if they misinform someone, and there are great consequences for any misinformation they give.

The education administrators or the principles are the most closely related in job function and education requirements. The functions of the job involve setting educational standards and goals and establishing the policies and procedures to carry them out. They also supervise managers, support staff, teachers, counselors, librarians, coaches, and others. They develop academic programs; monitor students' educational progress; train and motivate teachers and

other staff; manage guidance and other student services; administer recordkeeping; prepare budgets; handle relations with parents, prospective and current students, employers, and the community; and perform many other duties. Most education administrators begin their careers in related occupations, and prepare for a job in education administration by completing a master's or doctoral degree. In some cases, administrators move up from related staff jobs such as recruiter, guidance counselor, librarian, residence hall director, or financial aid or admissions counselor.

They're earnings are varied based on the position they have. The differing salaries are shown in the table below.

Directors, managers, coordinators, and supervisors	\$73,499
Principals:	
Elementary school	\$69,407
Jr. high/middle school	73,877
Senior high school	79,839
Assistant principals:	
Elementary school	\$56,419
Jr. high/middle school	60,842
Senior high school	64,811
(hrnext.com)	

The last comparable job that was found was the municipal administrator. The administrator is responsible for managing day-to-day municipal operations; annual, capital and utility budget preparation contract administration, purchasing, personnel and labor negotiations. The municipal administrator reports to a five member Township Committee. Administrators should have related college degree, but a graduate degree is preferred. Five years of municipal experience is required. The salary range is \$70,000 - \$88,000, depending on qualifications and experience.

Evaluating the Content of Librarians' Jobs

The next step was to determine a job evaluation system that would allow us to compare these different jobs to librarians using certain factors and assigning a weight to these factors.

The factors used were taken from the CUPE/UBC Job Evaluation System Project. There were 13 factors that were thought to be appropriate for assessing the content of a job.

The following chart lists the factors.

	Factor
1	Knowledge
2	Learning Experience
3	Judgment
4	Consequence of Error
5	Financial Responsibility
6	Responsibility for Goods, Tools, Equipment & Software
7	Supervision of Others
8	Contacts
9	Working Environment
10	Hazards
11	Dexterity
12	Physical Effort
13	Mental Effort

(CUPE/UBC JESP)

All 13 factors are measured in degrees depending on the extent to which the factor is applicable to the job. The following is a description of each factor:

1. Knowledge - implies the specialized or vocational training necessary to comprehensively understand the work elements involved to perform the job duties in a satisfactory manner.
2. Learning Experience - the characteristic time it takes an average individual to obtain the practical work experience required to perform the job duties adequately.

3. Judgment - measures the requirement of the position to exercise judgment in making decisions and carrying assignments within the parameters and constraints of the position.
4. Consequence of Error - used to measure the consequence of making errors in judgment. How vital is making an error in judgment to the job itself. What is the impact of that error in judgment to the organization financially as well as to the public in general.
5. Financial Responsibility - used to measure the responsibility or accountability for financial resources.
6. Responsibility For Goods, Tools, Equipment and Software - responsibility to operate, handle, adjust, adapt or maintain goods, tools equipment and software.
7. Supervision of Others – measures the continuing responsibility the incumbent assumes for the supervision and direction of staff.
8. Contacts - measures the responsibility for effective handling of personal contacts with students, faculty, other staff, members of other organizations and with the general public.
9. Working Environment - measures the frequency of exposure to undesirable or disagreeable environmental conditions under which the work is performed.
10. Hazards - measures the frequency of exposure to hazards or safety requirements under which the work is performed.
11. Dexterity – levels of manual dexterity are determined by considering the elements of hand/eye or hand/foot coordination. Movements can be either coarse, medium or fine.
12. Physical Effort - the physical fatigue that results from performing the duties of the job, sedentary or very mobile
13. Mental Effort - mental, visual and/or auditory fatigue that results from performing the job's duties, detail-oriented, precise, and/or calculated. (CUPE/UBC JESP)

The degrees to which each factor is measured can be found in the appendix.

Empirical Research: Developing the Test Instrument

With these factors in mind, I devised questions to determine the extent to which these factors impacted the jobs of librarians as well as comparable jobs. For example, how the factors related to the job and how important each factor was in the performance of that job. When formulating these questions I kept in mind the descriptions of the jobs that I was analyzing and comparing. The following questions were designed to measure the importance of each factor to the jobs studied.

- Question 1 – Knowledge: What educational level is required to perform the job?

This question is pretty basic and is almost necessary to evaluate any kind of job. I felt in order to evaluate the salary of any job, you need to know how much formal education is needed to perform the job adequately.

- Question 2 – Learning Experience: Is an apprenticeship or internship required and/or if not, is one highly recommended? How long does it take to learn the functions of the job?

This question was formulated with the thought that most jobs/professions are easier to get into if an apprenticeship or internship is served prior to looking for a permanent position. Sometimes additional training is required to learn the functions of the job, and if this is true, then they should be compensated accordingly.

- Question 3 – Judgment: How often are you put in a situation where you make decisions affecting the organization? How crucial are these decisions to the organization's operations and existence?

I felt this question was necessary to ask, because a lot of job's require some forms of judgment, but the essential question is will the decisions made effect the organization? Judgment calls that are important enough to effect the operation and existence of the organization obviously need to paid more than people who make routine, everyday decisions.

- Question 4 – Consequences of Error: Are the consequences (e.g. financial costs or services to the public) severe if there is an error in judgment? Can the error be easily rectified, and how long will it take to rectify? Is it costly to rectify?

This question was actually formulated with the job of civil engineers in mind. With consequence of error you try to calculate the extent of damage that can be done to the organization if an error is made in the decision-making process. Once you determine that an error has actually been

made, you want to know if the error is easily reversible, or something that cannot be reversed or is extremely costly to reverse.

- Question 5 – Financial Responsibility: How extensive are your financial responsibilities to the organization? Do you just handle or process cash and purchase acquisitions, administer a budget, or financially forecast and make recommendations?

It is important to know how much financial responsibility a person has in their job. The more financial responsibility that a person has, the more they are able to influence the organization by making purchases that could benefit or be hazardous to the corporation.

- Question 6 – Responsibility for Goods, Tools, Equipment, and Software: Do you purchase goods for the organization? Do you call on people to maintain these items, or are you responsible for maintaining them yourself?

When there is more responsibility for goods, as far as purchasing is concerned, then it usually denotes a higher position. As far as maintaining goods is concerned, it doesn't really mean too much in the way of financial compensation, because positions from supervisors to custodians have this responsibility.

- Question 7 – Supervision of Others: What is the extent of the supervision – delegate tasks, make schedules, give instruction whether technical or specialized?

It is important to determine to what extent there is supervision over others. Obviously training of individuals should require more pay than someone who simply makes a schedule. I feel that a supervisor who has more contact with their staff (i.e., training and delegating tasks) should be more highly compensated than someone who is more hands off, but then you get into the whole idea of empowerment, where employees want their own sense of freedom. I still feel that some sense of direction from the supervisor is still needed and required.

- Question 8 – Contacts: Do you go out and make your own contacts for the organization? How is the relationship with these contacts?

Good contacts can be very crucial to the success of an organization and it is pertinent that the relationships be on good terms. Good relationships with contacts is good for the appearance, as well as the reputation of the organization.

- Question 9 – Working Environment: How often are you exposed to unfavorable or threatening working conditions?

It is important to know how safe the working environment is, and how much the person's safety is in jeopardy every time they go to work.

- Question 10 – Hazards: What hazards are you exposed to and how severe are they? Are they life threatening?

This question is in conjunction with question 9 about the working environment. The more hazards encountered on the job lead to a more unsafe working environment, which in turn should elicit more pay.

- Question 11 – Dexterity: Are movements coarse, medium, or fine? (Coarse – heavy handed or rough motor movements. Medium – precise or accurate movements. Fine – delicate or intricate movements.)

In other words, how much skill does it take to perform the movement. Obviously fine movements require more skill and mental effort, whereas coarse movements might require more physical effort.

- Question 12 – Physical Effort: Does the job require you to perform tasks that cause fatigue, uncomfortable or awkward posture, does it require you to lift, push, and/or pull objects?

This question was formulated with the thought that more physical effort, such as the ones explained, increase the likelihood of injury. Jobs with high risk of injury due to physical effort should be compensated accordingly.

- Question 13 – Mental Effort: How many hours a day do you spend in sensory concentration (focusing of the senses – reading, word processing, driving, and transcribing tapes)?

Mental effort, like physical effort, could increase the likelihood of injury, of course not as much as physical effort. An injury that can be suffered from too much mental effort is carpal tunnel syndrome. In the case of mental effort, it's not so much the injury that can be suffered, but the discomfort of being in sensory concentration for extended periods of time.

The factor questions that I developed were used in drafting a state-wide survey directed at NJ public librarians. The survey is being used to assess the problems of hiring librarians in the information age at traditional salary levels. It will help to assess the dimensions of the problem. The rest of the survey can be found at the appendix to the paper.

After the evaluation system was determined, each comparable job, as well as the job of librarian, were assessed. Jobs were assessed using the factor questions as well as the degrees supplied by the job evaluation system used. (The factor questions as well as the degrees

assigned to the evaluation system can be found in the appendix.) The assessment of jobs was done using the descriptions of the jobs that were found in various sources. The findings are supportive of the fact that these jobs are similar in educational requirements as well as duties. The main difference that set the jobs apart was in the consequence of error. The civil engineer position has a higher consequence of error, a more threatening work environment, which includes more hazards, and more dexterity and physical effort than any of the other jobs.

After analyzing the evaluation, I felt that the civil engineer was not as good a comparison to the librarian as I had originally thought. As far as the municipal administrator and education administrator/principal, they are more similar with functions of the librarian. The one difference that sets them apart is that education administrators and municipal administrators are responsible for the advice they give, while librarians are not. The consequence of error for both of these jobs is greater than for the librarian. If you compare the evaluations for these three jobs, you will notice that their ratings are very close.

If you look at and compare the evaluations for these three jobs, you will see that they are pretty much identical.

Librarian	
Factor	Degrees
1 - Knowledge	8
2 - Learning Experience	3
3 - Judgment	4
4 - Consequences of Error	2
5 - Financial Responsibility	3
6 - Responsibility for Goods, Tools, Equipment, and Software	3
7 - Supervision of Others	3
8 - Contacts	4
9 - Working Environment	1
10 - Hazards	1
11 - Dexterity	3
12 - Physical Effort	2
13 - Mental Effort	3

Municipal Administrator	
Factor	Degrees
1 - Knowledge	7
2 - Learning Experience	3
3 - Judgment	3
4 - Consequences of Error	3
5 - Financial Responsibility	4
6 - Responsibility for Goods, Tools, Equipment, and Software	2
7 - Supervision of Others	2
8 - Contacts	4
9 - Working Environment	1
10 - Hazards	1
11 - Dexterity	2
12 - Physical Effort	1
13 - Mental Effort	3

Education Administrator/Principal	
Factor	Degrees
1 - Knowledge	8
2 - Learning Experience	3
3 - Judgment	4
4 - Consequences of Error	3
5 - Financial Responsibility	2
6 - Responsibility for Goods, Tools, Equipment, and Software	2
7 - Supervision of Others	2
8 - Contacts	4
9 - Working Environment	2
10 - Hazards	2
11 - Dexterity	2
12 - Physical Effort	1
13 - Mental Effort	3

Empirical Results for Job Content and Librarians' Comparable Worth

The next thing that had to be determined is whether the differences that exist between these jobs are substantial enough to justify the difference in pay. In comparison to the municipal

administrator, the librarian requires more knowledge, as far as the level of education is concerned. The librarian has more responsibility for goods, tools, equipment and software, has more direct supervision over others, uses more dexterity, and exerts more physical effort when performing the job. The municipal administrator has a greater consequence of error and more financial responsibility. While the librarian has more requirements and responsibilities, the administrator's job is more risky in that it can have a greater impact on the community if he/she makes an error in judgment. I believe this is sufficient enough to allow for some difference in pay, but not the gap that currently exists.

When comparing the librarian and the education administrator, there are fewer differences in the evaluation. Librarians have more financial responsibility, as well as responsibility for goods, tools, equipment, and software, more direct supervision over others, more dexterity and more physical effort. The education administrator has a greater consequence of error, and a more threatening work environment that includes more hazards. Once again the factor of consequence of error impacts wages in certain occupations. The difference in wages here is justified also, but, even understanding the important impact of the consequence of error, the disparity in salaries seems larger than it should be.

Conclusion

In conducting this study and doing the research, I have come to the conclusion that librarians might not necessarily need to make the same pay as the jobs I found to be comparable. However, librarians are underpaid for the job they do. Performing the functions of a librarian requires a lot of knowledge and skills, as well as responsibility for the facilities, supervision of others, and even some physical effort. Whether the difference in pay is due to the fact that it is a stereotypical female job, is hard to determine. Maybe society in general, values the factor of

consequence of error very highly, and believes that a job that has a high consequence should be compensated accordingly. Is it just a coincidence that this factor appears most often in male jobs and is rated at a higher level, or is it simply that we value men's work more? Do we perceive consequence of error to be an important factor because it's characteristic of a man's job? Do men typically occupy the jobs that have a higher consequence of error? It would be hard to put a dollar amount on a job based solely on consequence of error. What compensation would be enough; how can you put a price on the safety and well-being of an entire community?

When using the evaluation system with the various factors, it seems that there should be some kind of weighting system applied to the factors based on their importance in a person's ability to perform the job. I was able to find a generic weighting system, but I don't know if a generic system is appropriate. In some jobs, consequence of error is a greater factor to be considered than education. For example, police officers and airplane pilots don't need to attend college nor get advanced degrees, but their jobs have a huge consequence of error and a lot is at stake if they don't perform their job properly. Librarians on the other hand, need a lot of education and training to perform their jobs, but the consequence of error is very minimal. Looking at these three professions, consequence of error should carry more weight for the police officer and the pilot, and not as much for the librarian. Whatever the answer may be, the fact remains that librarians are underpaid for the work that they perform.

Bibliography

- Bellas, Marcia L. "Comparable Worth in Academia: The Effects on Faculty Salaries of the Sex Composition And Labor-Market Conditions of Academic Disciplines." American Sociological Review 59 (Dec 1994): 807-821.
- Biggs, Mary. "Sources of Tension and Conflict Between Librarians and Faculty." Journal of Higher Education 52 (1981): 182-201.
- Blau, Francine D. and Lawrence M. Kahn. "Gender Differences in Pay." Journal Of Economic Perspectives. 14 (2000): 75-99.
- CUPE/UBC JESP. Job Evaluation System Project. Introduction to the Manual. 1994.
- Dillon, Kristin E. and Herbert W. Marsh. "Faculty Earnings Compared with Those of Nonacademic Professionals." Journal of Higher Education. 52 (1981): 615-623.
- England, Paula and Dana Dunn. "Evaluating Work and Comparable Worth." Annual Review of Sociology. 14 (1988): 227-248.
- Garcia, Jaime, Pedro Hernandez, and Nicolas Lopez. "How Wide is The Gap? An Investigation of Gender Wage Differences using Quantile Regression." Empirical Economics. 26 (1) (March 2001): 149-167.
- Hopke, William E. The Encyclopedia of Careers and Vocational Guidance. 1993 9th ed.

Robinson, Derek. "Differences in Occupational Earnings by Sex."

International Labour Review. 137 (1) (1998): 3-31.

Sicilian, Paul and Adam J. Grossberg. "Investment in Human Capital and

Gender Wage: Evidence from NLSY." Applied Economics. 33 (4)

(March 2001) 463-471.

Stanek Kilbourne, Barbara. "Returns to Skill, Compensating Differentials, and

Gender Bias: Effects of Occupational Characteristics on the Wages of

White Women and Men." American Journal of Sociology. 100 (Nov

1994): 689-719.

Web Pages

www.bls.gov/oco/ocoirs.htm#R

www.hrnext.com

www.state.nj.us/personnel/specs/jobspecsform.htm

Outline

- I. Introduction – Review of thesis
- II. Comparable Worth
- III. Job Evaluations
- IV. Theories of Discrimination
 - A. Theory of Split Labor Markets
 - B. Marxist View
 - C. Neoclassical View
- V. Hiring Discrimination: Crowding Out
- VI. Evaluating Librarians for Comparable Worth
 1. specific job description
 2. library hierarchy
 3. educational requirements
- VII. Comparable Jobs
 - A. Disputed jobs
 1. archivist
 2. museum curator
 - B. Acceptable jobs
 1. civil engineer
 2. municipal administrator
 3. education administrator/principal
- VIII. Evaluating the Content of Librarians' Jobs
 - A. Review of Factors
- IX. Empirical Research: Developing the Test Instrument
 - A. Factor Questions
- X. Evaluation of Comparable Jobs
- XI. Conclusion

APPENDIX

Factor 1: Knowledge

Degree	Definition
1	Elementary school or equivalent training
2	Partial high school or equivalent training
3	Full high school or equivalent training
4	One year post secondary or equivalent training
5	Two years post secondary or equivalent training
6	Three years post secondary or equivalent training
7	Four years post secondary or equivalent training
8	Five or more years post secondary or equivalent training

Factor 2: Learning Experience

Degree	Compressed Time	Elapsed/Real Time
1	Up to 6 months	Up to 1 ½ years
2	Over 6 months and under 1 year	Over 1 ½ years and under 3 years
3	Over 1 year and under 1 ½ years	Over 3 years and under 4 ½ years
4	Over 1 ½ years and under 2 years	Over 4 ½ years and under 6 years
5	Over 2 years	Over 6 years

Factor 3: Judgment

Degree	Definition	Nature of Situations Typically Encountered
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Tasks are clearly defined - Little or no latitude exists for exercising judgment - Most problems are referred to supervisor - Little planning required. tasks arranged by others 	Repetitive and identical in nature
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Assignments are covered by well defined methods and procedures - Some latitude exists for organizing work or exercising judgment within established guidelines - Most unusual problems are referred to supervisor 	Similar in nature with choice among limited alternatives. (i.e. there is definite pattern to situations encountered. Required data and information is available or obtainable.)
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Assignments are covered by broadly established methods & procedures - The exercise of judgment is a normal requirement but is restrained by program objectives - Direction is sought when apparent solutions to problems are not within the intent of established practices. 	Differing in nature, requiring search for solutions among several alternatives. (i.e., there may be certain intangibles, uncertainty or missing information to assess and consider.)
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Assignments frequently involve modifying established methods or procedures, recognizing and analyzing problems/situations and using trouble shooting techniques to reach solutions or devising new courses of action within the intent of existing programs, legislation or professional standards. - The exercise of judgment is extensive and is complicated by the need to consult and coordinate action plans. - Supervisors are available in relation to administrative matters, and may be consulted on professional/clinical/technical matters, but solutions are not normally expected during such discussions. 	Variable in nature, requiring analytical, interpretive and evaluative thinking. (i.e., there are significant intangibles and uncertain to consider.)
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Assignments involve development of solutions to diverse and interrelated problems, often having conflicting requirements, affecting an individual or affecting specific policies or programs. - The exercise of judgment is extensive and involves complex issues. - Consultation will usually take place in a peer group or interdisciplinary team review. 	

Factor 4: Consequence of Error

Degree	Incorrect or inappropriate recommendations, decisions, or Actions could have the following consequences
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Little effect on financial costs and/or - Little effect on service to the public
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Obvious consequences on financial costs - Adverse client, patient, or public relations - Reduced service to the public - Requires intervention to deal with repercussions
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Serious, usually short term consequences - Significant financial costs - Reduced or impaired service to the public - Negative media reaction - Requires intervention by head of the department to deal with repercussions
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Major, frequently long-term consequences - Very substantial financial costs - Negative media reaction - Requires president's office and/or political debate to deal with the repercussions

Factor 5: Financial Responsibility

Degree	Definition
1	- No responsibility
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Handling or processing cash, purchase requisitions, checks, bonds, etc - Responsibility for initiating requests or authorizing the payment of materials delivered or services rendered
3	- Signing authority to make expenditures or recoveries according to detailed written procedures
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Administering a budget or contract - Authority to sign official contracts
5	- Financial forecasting and making recommendations based on those forecasts

Factor 6: Responsibility for Goods, Tools, Equipment and Software

Degree	Definition
1	No responsibility
2	Responsible for basic care and handling of goods, tools, equipment and software
3	Responsible for doing prescribed maintenance and/or making modifications/adjustments required to do the job

Factor 7: Supervision of Others

Degree	Definition
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Work doesn't have the requirement to exercise supervision - Occasionally may explain work procedures to new or inexperienced employees
2	<p>The job may involve:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Coordinating and scheduling the day to day work of other workers or volunteers in the unit and monitoring output, and/or - Providing functional supervision to others
3	<p>Employee acts as a supervisor or group leader of other workers or volunteers with responsibilities such as scheduling and assigning work, training staff, providing direction, checking work in progress and upon completion. This level has input into decision making for all or some personnel matters such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Making hiring or promotion recommendations - Appraising the work of others - Handling disciplinary matters

Factor 8: Contacts

Degree	Nature	Purpose A	Purpose B
		To exchange /discuss Information in accordance With current policies and Technical practices	To clarify/exchange and discuss information of a detailed or specialized nature requiring specialized knowledge; gain cooperation; coordinate activities or programs; mitigate high tension or emotional situations.
1	Courtesy		
2	Tact and discretion		
3	Communication, empathy and/or sensitivity skills		
4	Interpersonal and communication skills		

Factor 9: Working Environment

Degree	Exposure to Disagreeable Working Conditions
1	Almost no exposure to disagreeable conditions
2	Occasional exposure to minor disagreeable conditions
3	Frequent exposure to minor or Occasional exposure to major disagreeable conditions
4	Almost continuous exposure to minor or Frequent exposure to major disagreeable conditions
5	Almost continuous exposure to major disagreeable conditions

Factor 10: Hazards

Degree	Exposure to Hazard
1	Almost no exposure to hazards or safety requirements
2	Occasional exposure to minor hazards or safety requirements
3	Frequent exposure to minor or Occasional exposure to major hazards or safety requirements
4	Almost continuous exposure to minor or Frequent exposure to major hazards or safety requirements
5	Almost continuous exposure to major hazards or safety requirements

Factor 11: Dexterity

Degree	Coordination of Movements Required by Employee
1	Tasks do not demand course, medium or fine movements
2	Tasks demand coordination of coarse movements
3	Tasks demand coordination of medium movements
4	Tasks demand coordination of fine movements

Factor 12: Physical Effort

Degree	The Work Involves:
1	Occasional light physical activity
2	Frequent light physical activity or Occasional moderate physical activity
3	Almost continuous light physical activity or Frequent moderate physical activity or Occasional heavy physical activity
4	Almost continuous moderate physical activity or frequent heavy Physical activity
5	Almost continuous heavy physical activity

Factor 13: Mental Effort

Degree	Periods of Sensory Concentration Required
1	- Occasional short periods
2	- Frequent short periods or - Occasional intermediate periods
3	- Almost continuous short periods or - Frequent intermediate or - Occasional lengthy periods
4	- Almost continuous intermediate periods or - Frequent lengthy periods
5	- Almost continuous lengthy periods

Survey, Directors, NJ Public Libraries

We are gathering information on librarian salaries, to speak to library concerns that it has become increasingly difficult to hire librarians in the information age at traditional salary levels. We ask your participation in a state-wide survey to assess the dimensions of the problem. The Word file may be downloaded, data entered into the Word File, and then attached and returned to us via email. For page 2, which requests data on each librarian employed, please copy the questions to a new page for each librarian, and include the whole set of answers.

We also ask you to ***include the municipal ordinance on salaries*** from your town, township or borough with the survey. This will provide some basis for assessing library salaries. If you return the survey by email, you may send the ordinance separately to:

Addressee who will receive survey responses

Thank you in advance for your participation.

Signed ---

Survey, Directors, NJ Public Libraries By the Public Librarian Association

Information about the Library County_____

Name and address of the library_____

Your library fits which of the following? County library_____ Ass

Independent municipal library_____ Joint library
(serves more than 1 municipality)_____

About how large is the population of the municipality or area served by your library?_____

of professional librarians employed: full-time_____part-time_____ FTE_____

female_____ / # African-American_____ # Asian_____ # Hispanic

Number of other library employees full-time_____ part-time_____ FTE_____

female_____ / # African-American_____ # Asian_____ # Hispanic

Referring to the Minimum Funding Law, is your library funded

below the minimum_____ at the minimum_____ above the minimum_____

Data on Professional Librarians currently employed. Please fill out a copy of these 2 sheets for yourself and each of your librarians, or ask them to, for the purpose of data analysis.

***Branching question at this point about Civil Service? What are the specific Civil Service concerns?

Job Title: _____

What is the highest degree you have completed? B. A._____
Masters_____ Ph.D._____

In what year? _____

If you have credits towards another advanced degree, how many credits toward what degree?

credit-hours_____ degree_____

How many years have you worked in this library? _____ Your age _____

How many years experience as a librarian did you have before working here? _____

Are you represented by a union? Yes _____ No _____

Compensation: Salary \$ _____ Vacation time _____ Sick time _____

Individual health insurance: Paid by library alone _____ Paid by employee alone _____

Costs shared by library and employee _____

Family members' health insurance: Paid by library alone _____

Paid by employee alone _____

Costs shared by library and employee _____

Retirement contribution by library? _____ % of base pay

Wages and Hours

Do you earn longevity pay (a raise after working at your library for a certain period, often 10 years)? Yes _____ No _____ If so, how

If so, after how many years did you qualify for longevity pay? _____

Have you ever earned a (one-time) bonus for any other reason?

Yes _____ No _____

If so, how large was the bonus? \$ _____

How many hours/week are you required to work in your position?

Are you an exempt employee (not eligible for overtime pay)?

Yes _____ No _____

If you ever work more than required, how many hours overtime do you put in each month, whether you are paid for them or not? _____

<p>Do you: If you do:</p>	<p>Earn regular pay or comp-time</p>	<p>Earn time and a half or 1.5x usual pay or comp-time</p>	<p>Earn double time or 2x regular pay or comp-time</p>
---	--------------------------------------	--	--

Saturday work			
Sunday work			

Technology Requirements of the Job

	Required	Encouraged	Of Minor Importance
Web Design			
Convert Text to HTML			
PC (computer) maintenance			
Instructing clients in use of Computers			
Instructing clients in use of Software			
Database Management			
Database Searching Skills			

Questions for Library Director and Assistant Directors: Job Title _____

How many people do you supervise? _____

Do you have overall responsibility for maintaining the physical plant? Yes_____ No_____

Are you on call 24 hours/day, 7 days/week with regard to the library building, heat, air conditioning, possible break-ins, vandalism or fire? Yes_____No _____

As Director, do you serve on Township or County committees by statute? Yes_____No_____

If so, on average how many hours a week do you spend on committee work? _____hours/week

Does your job take you outside of the office to other sites (e.g., conferences)?Yes_____ No_____

If so, about how many hours/month are you outside the office on average? _____ hours/month

Which of the following describes your decision-making powers?
Recommend all decisions to a Board or Council_____

Recommend corporate policy decisions to a Board or Council, you are responsible for procedural decisions_____

Recommend some or all procedural decisions to a superior_____

Do you make all hiring/firing decisions?Yes_____ No_____

Hiring decisions must be approved by superior/board_____

If you have authority to set wages, do you consider the cost-of-living in your compensation proposals to your board?

Yes_____ No_____

If so, how do you measure cost-of-living (consumer price index, other index)?_____

Is your wage limited by a municipal cap, where the town limits all pay increases to a certain maximum amount or percentage increase? Yes_____ No_____

If so, what is the cap this year? _____

Are any library employees subject to the municipal ordinance on salaries? Yes_____ No_____

If so, are professional librarians? Yes_____No_____

Are there steps and ranges specified for professional librarian pay scales? If so, please enclose a copy of these. Yes_____ No_____

Do your hires have to comply with civil service rules?
***for non-civil-service hires

In what year did you last try to hire a professional librarian?_____

How many openings did you have?_____. What salary did you end up paying? \$_____

How long did it take you to hire someone, after the ad was placed? _____months

Were you satisfied with the number of candidates applying?
Yes_____ No_____

How many people turned down your job offer?_____

Where did they go instead? Please list any alternative positions you were told of:

